1. Lectures seem about right, if a little fast.
2. Yes.
3. Before on Tuesdays, after on Thursdays.
4. Good how it is (allows me more time to focus on the semester project.)
5. A little slowly: still in the process of framing the problem.
6. Seems interactive enough. You ask if we have any questions, and we are free to ask more during the lecture.
1. Are the lectures too fast/too slow/too high level/too low level etc?

I find I'm good at picking up broad-brush material but don't follow the lower-level details.

2. Are you actually able to connect your readings to lectures?

Sometimes. Again, I'm better at getting high-level ideas than lower-level. The readings tend to be pretty dense and I usually have to read them several times before I fully grasp them.

3. Are you reading before or after the topics are discussed?

I try to skim them before class but don't always find the time.

4. Should there be more assessment (homeworks/projects etc)?

While obviously any student is going to hesitate to ask for more homework, I think it's easier for me to learn the material when I have to apply it. I think I grasp the material on the most recent homework much better than I did before it was assigned.

5. How is the progress towards semester project coming (qualitatively speaking--you will have an opportunity for detailed answers anyway)

I haven't made it out of the idea phase yet. I think the topic I've picked is broad and tough to apply to planning, and I spent most of last week on the homework for this class and another I'm taking. I'm just about to submit some ideas to a few more people who are talking about similar projects, so I'm moving forward.

6. Are the classes interactive enough or should they encourage more discussion?

More discussion would be good. My classmates ask interesting questions.

If the latter, what can we do other than stopping for questions?

That's a hard one. Sometimes I don't even know what questions to ask.

7. Overall, how does it compare to other graduate level courses you took/taking
I am enjoying the class and believe I'm learning a lot, but the pace is brisker and the reading load heavier than any other grad course I am currently or have previously taken. As I said above, I find myself following the high-level concepts well but becoming lost on specific theory, algorithms, etc. I think I'm keeping up all right, but not as well as I'd like.
1. Are the lectures too fast/too slow/too high level/too low level etc?

Too fast. No emphasize on parts that more important. They cannot be all equally important.

2. Are you actually able to connect your readings to lectures?

Sometimes. Sometimes I cannot connect lecture to slides.

3. Are you reading before or after the topics are discussed?

Usually after

4. Should there be more assessment (homeworks/projects etc)?

No

5. How is the progress towards semester project coming (qualitatively speaking-- you will have an opportunity for detailed answers anyway)

10%

6. Are the classes interactive enough or should they encourage more discussion?
   If the latter, what can we do other than stopping for questions?

Do not overwhelm

7. Overall, how does it compare to other graduate level courses you took/taking (positively or negatively)

If you will cut the load by half, you still be ahead of everyone, and by far. Too much material to cover. The essence is lost in the size of material.

Hope, the answers do not affect the grade.
1. Are the lectures too fast/too slow/too high level/too low level etc?  
The level is quite fast, but reasonable, as we need to cover many interesting topics in the semester.

2. Are you actually able to connect your readings to lectures?  
Yes, I do. I see the clear picture about organization of the lectures in the class.

3. Are you reading before or after the topics are discussed?  
Yes.

4. Should there be more assessment (homeworks/projects etc)?  
Yes. Homeworks are always useful for me to understand the topics, also you should give more questions in depth-thoughts (not only questions like "how to do this" but "why ... is true" as well, because some can not be discovered after some first times reading the paper -- for example, prove some properties of Graphplan,...).

5. How is the progress towards semester project coming?  
It's progressive, I think.

6. Are the classes interactive enough or should they encourage more discussion? If the latter, what can we do other than stopping for questions?  
People are still asking in the class whenever they want...

7. Overall, how does it compare to other graduate level courses you took/taking (positively or negatively)?  
I like your course always :-)

---------------------------------------------------------------------------
(message)

Good day,

let me summarize my feedback in 2 points.

Thinks I like:

'Top of the line' content: The class covers current topics and status in research, allowing the students to 'hop in' and contribute in any if the areas they are interested in.

Lots of reading, discussing: The 'required' readings for the class are very nice way to introduce the students to the topic, which are then discussed in the class. I would also like to add why I think people are not asking questions. I will speak for myself, I was not really that familiar with the planning topics, and while reading through the papers, I can tell I understand them. However, at this stage I cannot go further and ask meaningful questions that would add to the discussion. Maybe adding some more focus(when assigning the reading, telling us on which part of the paper to 'focus' and think about) on what to look at, with respect to what i said before, would help.

Things I don't like:

Homeworks: It's not that I don't like homeworks, it's just I would expect some kind of 'higher' level homework, requiring people to think, not just follow a certain algorithm to perform a task. For example, instead of just having to construct SAT/CSP etc. representations, how about modifying the basic planning problem, and then asking us to provide the corresponding SAT/CSP encoding. Hence we cannot use what was given, and have to come up with a solution to the problem.

Overall, I have a vey good impression of the class so far.

That sums it up for me, thanks for your time.
The course and the instructor are amazing. It has been great so far. The best thing about the class is the readings that are posted before each class. Unfortunately, I am not a planning person and I would not understand a few things in the readings. However, Dr. Rao's teaching and his in-class examples make everything clear and makes me read more after the class. I would say, this class has taught me a lot and the best class I have taken so far. It is a lot of effort, but that's the best part of the class, you learn a lot.

Answers to the questions:
1. The lectures are the real way they have to be and it's perfect.
2. Already answered, yes.
3. Yes.
4. The home-works are another great thing to say. They take a lot of time and monotonous, but they make us understand each concept really well. The homeworks are great the way they are.
5. Not as bad as expected, improving by readings.
6. Yes, the classes are interactive enough.
7. Already answered, learning a lot from this class. Honestly, cannot compare it with any other grad level class.

Other Comments:
Though I did say the in-class examples are good, it would be great if there are more examples in the slides as well. The reason is that we do not have any other material other than the class slides, notes and papers.

------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------
1. Are the lectures too fast/too slow/too high level/too low level etc?
I feel the lectures are at the right pace and level.

2. Are you actually able to connect your readings to lectures?
Yes

3. Are you reading before or after the topics are discussed?
Mixture of both.

4. Should there be more assessment (homeworks/projects etc)?
Personally, I do not prefer more homeworks or exams. I would prefer to concentrate on the final project.

5. How is the progress towards semester project coming (qualitatively speaking -- you will have an opportunity for detailed answers anyway)
Progress is slower than expected mainly because of time constraints. However, I think I will have a lot more time during the last month and half.

6. Are the classes interactive enough or should they encourage more discussion?
If the latter, what can we do other than stopping for questions?
To me, the classes already offer reasonable discussion opportunities.

7. Overall, how does it compare to other graduate level courses you took/taking (positively or negatively)
The material covered is at about the same level. However, I think the classes are more informative than the other courses.
Generally speaking, I love this course a lot. But I sort of feel sorry for it, since I cannot finish reading the materials before class. I could have learned more from this course. Anyway, I think this is a great course. It gives me almost exactly what I want and even more.

For the speed of the class, I feel it is hard to catch up with it. But I believe it is my problem, so it is fine. As for assessment, please do not give up more. If I can catch up the reading speed, I would like the class to be even more interactive. Thank you.
1. Are the lectures too fast/too slow/too high level/too low level etc?

The lecture pace is just fine. I would like the lectures to be a bit more low-level (vis-à-vis the level of depth) on certain planning related topics that I am interested in (Temporal Planning, Planning with Uncertainty (not covered yet), ESP etc.) but I also understand that this is a general planning class, and needs to cover all areas of planning within the stipulated time.

2. Are you actually able to connect your readings to lectures?

Yes. Since the lectures don’t follow the textbook too closely, and are instead modeled mostly around the readings, I am able to make connections.

3. Are you reading before or after the topics are discussed?

I am reading before the class for which a reading is assigned.

4. Should there be more assessment (homeworks/projects etc)?

We could do with more homeworks, since I have noticed that most of the material in 471 remains with one only if one does a homework targeting that specific material (for e.g., Bayes Nets, Search algorithms, Logic etc.) Similarly, hw 1 helped me get more familiar with graphplan style techniques, and also compilation techniques. I think more homeworks are definitely called for [if they don’t fit into the grading scheme, they may be made optional, for those who are interested to attempt]. I think one of the best ways to understand the material is by doing (written homeworks).

5. How is the progress towards semester project coming (qualitatively speaking—-you will have an opportunity for detailed answers anyway)

My progress in the semester project is good, but I suspect only because I have been working closely with one of the czars. I think there should be more monitoring intervals, and perhaps some mid-of-the-line deliverables (perhaps written). Also (I don’t know if this is the case already, but) the instructor should probably discuss the progress with czars and inform the student concerned in case the progress isn’t satisfactory.

6. Are the classes interactive enough or should they encourage more discussion? If the latter, what can we do other than stopping for questions?
I think the classes can get more interactive from the student side, i.e., more students should participate in the discussions. One way of doing this is to have a mandatory (that seems to be the only way, otherwise no one would bother after a couple of tries) "class-participation" discussion either on the blog or the wiki (wiki preferable) about the reading assigned for the next class, and in general the topic of discussion for the next lecture. For Tuesday classes, this could be a more detailed discussion, whereas for Thursdays it should be lesser (owing to the less time). Alternatively, there could be just one “mandatory discussion” per week, which will be due before the Tuesday class of each week.

7. Overall, how does it compare to other graduate level courses you took/taking (positively or negatively)

This course is more graduatey than most other graduate courses I have taken (both as an undergrad and a grad). However, any graduate course owes its success as much to participation as to committed teaching — therefore I think the students need to be nudged into taking more of the incredible research-frontier and discussion opportunities this class offers.